FAMILY LAW: CASES AND MATERIALS

VOLUME II

1990-91

CAROL ROGERSON
FACULTY OF LAW UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FAMILY LAW
Cases and Materials
VOLUME II
1990-91

Carol Rogerson
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

Prepared with the assistance of Ranald Sinclair
## V. THE ECONOMICS OF MARRIAGE BREAKDOWN

### A. The Economics of Family Life

- Moller Okin, *Justice, Gender and the Family* 587
- News clippings 615

### B. The Economic Consequences of Marriage Breakdown

- Rogerson, "Winning the Battle, Losing the War" 622
- *Toronto Star*, "2 Million Canadian Families Live in Poverty" 632
- Dept. of Justice, *Evaluation of the Divorce Act* 652
- Mossman, Review of *The Divorce Revolution* 657
- Mossman and MacLean, "Family Law and Social Welfare" 660

## VI. MATRIMONIAL PROPERTY

### A. Historical Overview

#### a) Common Law


#### b) Trust Doctrine

- LRCC, *Family Property* 669
- Youdan, "Unjust Enrichment and Constructive Trusts" 671
- Note: *Murdoch v. Murdoch* 677
- *Rathwell v. Rathwell* 678
- *Pettkus v. Becker* 693
- *Globe and Mail*, "Woman's Suicide Ends Fight For Rights" 705
- *Sorochan v. Sorochan* 706
- Youdan, "Unjust Enrichment and Constructive Trusts" 713
- Note: Recent Decisions on Unjust Enrichment and Constructive Trust 725
## c) Statutory Reform

| LRCC, *Family Property*, "Primary Approaches to Reform" | 727 |

## B. The FLA

### a) The Partnership Principle

| Steel, "The Ideal Marital Property Regime" | 743 |
| Knetsch, "Some Economic Implications of Matrimonial Property Rules" | 744 |
| Prager, "Shifting Perspectives on Marital Property Law" | 753 |
| Eekelaar, *Family Law and Social Policy* "Adjustment on Divorce" | 758 |
| Weitzman, *The Divorce Revolution*, "The Nature of Marital Property" | 762 |
| Fineman, "Implementing Equality" | 767 |
| Rogerson, "Winning the Battle, Losing the War" | 768 |

### b) Overview of Equalization of Net Family Property Under the FLA

#### i) Calculation of the Equalization Payment

| Goodman, "Matrimonial Property" from Family Law Bar Admission Course Materials | 775 |
| Skrli v. Skrli | 786 |
| Folga v. Folga | 791 |
| Miller v. Miller | 794 |
| Black v. Black | 795 |
| Fredricks, "The Ownership Conundrum" | 799 |
| Wolfson and Corbin, "Problems of Title and Constructive Trust" | 801 |
| Note: Proposed Amendments to the FLA | 802 |

#### ii) Implementation of the Equalization Payment

| Humphreys v. Humphreys | 803 |
| Goodman, "Matrimonial Property" from Family Law Bar Admission Course Materials | 810 |
c) Selected Problems in Determining NFP

i) Valuation and Costs of Disposition

Goodman, "Matrimonial Property" from Family Law Bar Admission Course Materials...
Kelly v. Kelly
McPherson v. McPherson
Heon v. Heon
Lawyers Weekly (Starkman v. Starkman)...

ii) Continued Role of Constructive Trust

Kelly v. Kelly
Rawluk v. Rawluk
Note: Applications of Constructive Trust under the FLA

iii) Pensions

Pask, "Pensions and the Elderly"

1) Employer-Sponsored Pension Plans

Note
Marshall v. Marshall
Humphreys v. Humphreys
Note: New Cases on Pension Valuation and Settlement
Note: Proposed Reforms Respecting Pension Division
Veres v. Veres
Butt v. Butt
Lawyers Weekly (Abate v. Abate)

2) Canada Pension Plan

Weisberg, "Canada Pension Plan Credit Sharing"
Albrecht v. Albrecht

iv) Future Interests

Brinkos v. Brinkos
v) **Educational Degrees, Professional Licenses and other forms of "Human Capital"**

Weitzman, "The New Property" in *The Divorce Revolution* 918
Dulude, *Love, Marriage and Money* 928
Selick, "Pitfalls in Professional Degree Valuation" 932
O'Brien v. O'Brien 933
Corless v. Corless 939
Caratun v. Caratun 945
Bala, "Recognizing Spousal Contributions" 958
Keast v. Keast 966
Note: Magee v. Magee 969
Linton v. Linton 970
Note: Cole v. Cole 985
Drummond v. Smith 986

**d) Departures from Equal Sharing**

**i) Unequal Contributions**

Farr v. Farr 991
LeBlanc v. LeBlanc 994
*Toronto Star*, "A New Day in a Hard Life" 999
Elsom v. Elsom 1000
Waters v. Waters 1002
Sullivan v. Sullivan 1006
Davies v. Davies 1008
Berdette v. Berdette 1009
Note: Peake v. Peake 1014

**ii) Depletion of Assets; Conduct**

Scott v. Scott 1015
Note: Cowan v. Cowan 1017

**iii) Short Marriage; Pre-Marital Property**

Murphy v. Murphy 1018
Note: Jordan v. Jordan 1020
Lawyers Weekly (*Futia v. Futia*) 1021

**iv) Post-Separation Needs and other Post-Separation Events**

Note: Skrli v. Skrli, Kelly v. Kelly, McCutcheon v. McCutcheon, and Crane v. Crane 1022
VII. THE MATRIMONIAL HOME

A. Introduction

a) Special Role of the Matrimonial Home
   Hovius, "The Matrimonial Home" .......................... 1029

b) History of Legal Rights in the Matrimonial Home
   Bissett-Johnson and Holland, Matrimonial
   Property Law in Canada .................................. 1030
   OLRC, Report on Family Law .............................. 1032


a) Overview of Part II of the FLA
   Wolfson and Corbin, "The Matrimonial Home
   Under the FLA" ......................................... 1033

b) Orders for Exclusive Possession
   Bissett-Johnson and Holland, Matrimonial
   Property Law in Canada .................................. 1038
   i) Exclusive Possession or Sale at Trial?
      Weitzman, "Disposition of the Family
      Home" from The Divorce Revolution .................. 1040
      Rosenthal v. Rosenthal ................................ 1045
      Cicero v. Cicero ....................................... 1047
      Note: Review of Case Law ............................ 1048
      Note: Exclusive Possession on the Basis
      of Emotional Attachment to the
      Matrimonial Home .................................... 1049
      Note: Alternatives to Exclusive
      Possessive ............................................ 1050
ii) **Interim or Temporary Exclusive Possession: Excluding a Spouse from the Matrimonial Home**

Pifer v. Pifer ........................................ 1051
Serruys v. Serruys .................................... 1054
Hill v. Hill ............................................. 1057

c) **Groups Precluded from Protection**

i) **Unmarried Cohabitants**

Orlando, "Exclusive Possession of the Family Home: The Plight of Battered Cohabitees" ............... 1063
Note: Czora v. Lonergan ................................. 1065

ii) **Native Women**

Note: Derrickson v. Derrickson,
Paul v. Paul, and Wynn v. Wynn .......................... 1066

---

VIII. **SPOUSAL SUPPORT**

A. **Historical Origins of Spousal Support**

Eekelaar and Maclean, *Maintenance After Divorce* .... 1067

B. **Law Reform: Modern Spousal Support Law**

Eekelaar and Maclean, "The Evolution of Private Law Maintenance Obligations" ...................... 1069
LRCC, *Maintenance on Divorce* .......................... 1072
Davies, "The Changing Face of Spousal Support Law in Canada" ........................................... 1075
Deech, "Financial Relief" .................................. 1080
Smart, *The Ties that Bind* ................................ 1082
Weitzman, "The Economics of Divorce" ..................... 1084
Dept. of Justice, *Evaluation of the Divorce Act, Spousal Support" .............................. 1085

C. **Continuing Debate Over the Principles**

Rogerson, "The Causal Connection Test" .................. 1088
Trebilcock, "A Law and Economics Perspective on the Role of Private Ordering in Family Law" .... 1102
Eekelaar and Maclean, "The Evolution of Private Law Maintenance Obligations" .......................... 1114

a) Basic Principles: Causal Connection

Messier v. Delage ........................................... 1116
Note: The Supreme Court of Canada "Trilogy" ........ 1130
Pelech v. Pelech ............................................. 1131
Richardson v. Richardson ................................. 1150

Note: The Legacy of the "Trilogy"

i) Cases Applying Causal Connection
   Note: Winterle, Schroeder, Williams, Duff ......... 1164
   Willms v. Willms ......................................... 1165

ii) Cases Not Applying Causal Connection
    Note: Smith, Marquis ................................. 1167
    Madill v. Madill ......................................... 1167
    Note: Fisher, Doncaster ............................. 1174
    Story v. Story ........................................... 1175

LRCC, Maintenance on Divorce ........................... 1184
Rogerson, "The Causal Connection Test" ................. 1186

b) Promoting Self-Sufficiency: Recognition of the Advantages and Disadvantages of the Marriage and its Breakdown

i) Long-Term, "Traditional" Marriages

LRCC, Maintenance on Divorce ........................... 1191
Karlovec v. Karlovec ...................................... 1192
Rednall v. Rednall ......................................... 1195
Note: Linton v. Linton .................................... 1201

ii) Shorter Marriages: "Modern" or "Traditional"?

Seward v. Seward ......................................... 1201
Bast v. Bast ................................................. 1203
Heinemann v. Heinemann ................................... 1204
Mullin v. Mullin ............................................. 1210
Lawyers Weekly (Ormerod v. Ormerod) .................... 1213
c) Continued Child Care Responsibilities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LRCC, Maintenance on Divorce</td>
<td>1215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Desmarais v. Desmarais</td>
<td>1216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brockie v. Brockie</td>
<td>1218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thorsteinson v. Thorsteinson</td>
<td>1222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jull v. Jull</td>
<td>1225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fejes v. Fejes</td>
<td>1228</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

d) Conduct

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lawyers Weekly (Anderson v. Anderson)</td>
<td>1229</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>